

Hate Ontology



About the Project

The EU-funded project sCAN - Platforms, Experts, Tools: Specialised Cyber-Activists Network (2018-2020), coordinated by Licra (International League Against Racism and Antisemitism), aims at gathering expertise, tools, methodology and knowledge on cyber hate and developing transnational comprehensive practices for identifying, analysing, reporting and counteracting online hate speech. This project draws on the results of successful European projects already realised, for example the "Research, Report, Remove project: Countering Cyber-Hate phenomena" and "Facing Facts", and strives to continue, emphasize and strengthen the initiatives developed by the civil society for counteracting hate speech.

Through cross-European cooperation, the project partners are enhancing and (further) intensifying their fruitful collaboration. The sCAN project partners are contributing to selecting and providing relevant automated monitoring tools to improve the detection of hateful content. Another key aspect of sCAN is the strengthening of the monitoring actions (e.g. the monitoring exercises) set up by the European Commission.

The project partners are also jointly gathering knowledge and findings to better identify, explain and understand trends of cyber hate at a transnational level. Furthermore, this project aims to develop cross-European capacity by providing e-learning courses for cyber-activists, moderators and tutors through the Facing Facts Online platform.

sCAN is implemented by ten different European partners, namely ZARA - Zivilcourage und Anti-Rassismus-Arbeit from Austria, CEJI-A Jewish contribution to an inclusive Europe from Belgium, Human Rights House Zagreb from Croatia, Romea from Czech Republic, Respect Zone from France, jugendschutz.net from Germany, CESIE from Italy, Latvian Centre For Human Rights from Latvia and the University of Ljubljana, Faculty of Social Sciences from Slovenia.

The sCAN project is funded by the European Commission Directorate - General for Justice and Consumers, within the framework of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship (REC) Programme of the European Union.

Legal Disclaimer

This Hate Ontology was funded by the **European Union's Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (2014-2020)**.

The contents of this publication are the sole responsibility of the sCAN project consortium and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Commission



Project funded by the European Union's Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (2014-2020)

Content

Introduction	4
1. Racism and xenophobia	6
2. Anti-Semitism	10
3. Anti-Muslim hatred	13
4. Anti-refugee hatred	16
5. Antigypsyism	18
6. Homophobia	21
7. Misogyny	23
8. Hatred against persons with disabilities	26
9. Hatred against socially-disadvantaged groups	28
Conclusion	31

Introduction

With this publication, the sCAN project partners, namely LICRA (France), Human Rights House Zagreb (Croatia), jugendschutz.net (Germany), CESIE (Italy), Zara — Zivilcourage und Anti-Rassismus-Arbeit (Austria), Spletno oko (Slovenia), ROMEA (Czech Republic), and the Latvian Centre for Human Rights (Latvia), bring their contribution to the further expansion of the body of knowledge and literature on online hate speech, to enable researchers, cyber activists, and the civil society representatives to better recognise and contrast the phenomenon of cyber hate.

For the purpose of this work, the definition of online hate speech used by the International Network Against Cyber Hate (INACH) will apply, for which "Hate speech is intentional or unintentional public discriminatory and/or defamatory statements; intentional incitement to hatred and/or violence and/or segregation based on a person's or a group's real or perceived race, ethnicity, language, nationality, skin colour, religious beliefs or lack thereof, gender, gender identity, sex, sexual orientation, political beliefs, social status, property, birth, age, mental health, disability, disease^{1"}.

The mass diffusion of the Internet, paired with the rise in number and size of the Web 2.0 platforms and websites, has contributed to the skyrocketing of hateful messages and contents shared by individuals, organised groups and politicians. The reasons behind are manifold, and can span from the mere need to unload a general feeling of frustration and intolerance against real or presumed categories of people, to the manipulation of information and the spreading of fake news in order to frame single narratives about certain real or presumed groups or certain minorities for political and electoral returns.

What is now understood, is that vulnerable individuals are at a particular risk when exposed to hateful contents and propaganda on the Internet. Indeed, interaction with others through Internet channels fuels a sense of belonging and common cause², therefore there must be a shared effort to prevent and contrast the spread, attraction and impact of illegal online hate speech, as this can potentially lead to the growth of radicalization, leading to the escalation of hate speech into hate crimes, radicalization and violence in the physical world.

Despite this gained awareness, little is known about the main trends, words, expressions and codes used by the online haters to disseminate fake news and cyber hate. Indeed, discriminatory and defamatory statements, as well as the incitement to hatred, violence and segregation, can be built upon a number of words and sentences that, if decontextualized, would not bear any hateful or illegal meaning themselves. This specific aspect makes the contrast of illegal hate speech, especially through automated monitoring tools, extremely challenging and burdensome, as the mere filter of well-known disdainful and derogatory words is not enough to intercept and report the enormous variety of subtle sentences and codes which are apparently harmless but in fact bear strong messages of hate.

This is the rationale behind the present work: the sCAN project partners and members of the International Network Against Cyber Hate, have researched the concepts and keywords that can signpost potential hate content on the Internet, collecting them in a new analytical report, the Hate Ontology.

The present Ontology covers the terminology used against minority groups mostly targeted by cyber hate, and is organised in the following categories: Racism and Xenophobia; Antisemitism; Anti-Muslim hatred; Anti-refugees hatred; Anti-Gypsyism; Homophobia; Misogyny; Hate against disabled people and Hate against socially disadvantaged group.

¹ http://www.inach.net/cyber-hate-definitions/

² COM(2016) 379 final

For each category, a synthetic database is provided for the French, Czech, Croatian, German, Italian, Slovenian and Latvian languages. When applicable, references to the historical, cultural and social origins and/or context of use of the reported terms and expressions are provided.

1. Racism and xenophobia

In **France**, anti-black racist theories are frequently present on social networks in relation to French contextual events. Since 2016, anti-black content was promoted on the main IT platforms – Twitter, Facebook and YouTube as well as on blogs and websites.

Online anti-black racists use classical trends: comparison to **monkeys**; denunciation of "**uncivilized race**" and "denunciation of the "**suburb scum**". The latter trend is also present in anti-Arab racism – geographical racism against people living in suburbs.

Another trend is the rejection of "race mixing", perceived as an abomination and a danger for the future of the "White European race". For example, in 2017, a tweet of a picture of a French black actor, Omar Sy and his white wife became viral with the following message: "The racial mixture is an abomination on the plan of the Divine creation".

For what concerns anti-Arab racism, it should be noted that, in France, it is often close or overlapping to anti-Muslim hate. There is in fact confusion between being a Muslim, an Arab and a jihadist. The consequences of ISIS terror in France are indeed terrible for the Muslim communities. Anti-Arab racist trends are widely used on social networks. The main targets of this kind of racism are mostly people originating from Maghreb countries, such as Morocco, Algeria and Tunisia. They are considered as crooked, as thieves or as rapist. Women with Arab background are also victims of misogyny in addition to this racism.

For example, the use of the word "beurette", a negative term for young women originating from Maghreb, is quite widespread. The symbolic meaning behind this term is racist as well as most of the time pornographic. In November 2017, a young French journalist, Nadia Daam, became a victim of a violent harassment campaign after criticizing an online video games forum considered as especially active in misogynist and racist campaigns. She was harassed on Twitter and on other platforms. The insult "beurette" was quite frequently used against her.

As in the case of anti-Black racism, there is a trend to denounce the **suburb scum**. A specific racist vocabulary is thereby used: the very offensive term "**bougne**" or "**gnioule**", contractions of the term "**bougnoule**" (in English, "wog").

Finally, hate against Asians used to be a non openly/publicly declared racism, but racist acts offline and online are more and more present in French society. For instance, the online hashtag #J'airiencontre-leschinois (#IhavenothingagaisntChinese) emerged in 2016. With this hashtag, Twitter users promoted anti-Asiatic prejudices, as for example "@JoFaitLeMalin #IhaveNothingAgainstTheChinese however my dog doesn't like them, these bastards". Other insults are popular as "bridés" ("slanted"), "chintok" ("chink"), "niakoués" ("gooks", "Vietnamese")

In the Czech Republic, as in other places, the actual skin colour of people is not the only characteristic connected with racial prejudice. For example, Romani people are perceived and referred to as "black" irrespective of their actual appearance, and are sometimes racially abused even if their actual skin colour is "white". The main targets of anti-black racism in the Czech Republic are any people without "white" skin or naturally blond hair, especially black persons of African origin who are either openly abused (often called "monkeys" - opice) or viewed as if they are an exotic species from the human

"zoo". Racists stereotype such people as "dirty", "lazy" and "dangerous". African-origin or black people comprise just a negligible percentage of the population of the Czech Republic.

Closely related to racism is xenophobia, which may include anyone perceived as non-Czech (and often even as non-Christian or non-Western). Milder forms of xenophobia target the biggest groups of people with migrant background living in the country, namely, the Vietnamese and Ukrainians, while the most severe forms target Arabs, Muslims, and African origin or black people. Xenophobic hate against refugees is of particular relevance. In general, it is hard to separate racism in the Czech Republic from xenophobia, antigypsyism, anti-Muslim hatred and antisemitism, as many instances of hate speech involve multiple motivations.

Most of the Czech words used for racial abuse are related to blackness, to accusations of "parasitism", to "dirt", to associating people with animals in order to dehumanize them, etc. Racists frequently tell those they hate to "go back where they came from", refer to foreign nationals as "cizáci", etc.

Other examples of offensive words are **přivandrovalci** (infiltrators); **ilegáli** i.e. those ridiculed for being irregular migrants

In **Croatia**, racism is mostly common against neighboring former Yugoslavian countries and population. One specific example is the anti-Semitic "Ready for the Homeland" (**Za dom spremni**) salute.

The iconography and salutes originated during WWII in Croatia, from 1941 to 1945 (while Croatia was a fascist puppet-state called Independent State of Croatia) re-emerged in the 90's civil war mostly in the logos of military units, slogans and greetings used by them and continue to be used today by war veterans' associations and initiatives linked to them. There have been attempts to discuss whether the usage of such references is in line with the Constitution, but as there is no real political will to settle this issue, it became a shady area. One may say that there is no will due to the fact that war veterans' associations and their associates constitute a significant share of the electorate of the conservatives and new-right parties.

On the other hand, institutions such as the Ombudsman office issued a statement regarding the usage of disputed salute "Za dom spremni!" or "Ready for the Homeland!", Croatian equivalent of "Sieg Heil!". In the statement the Ombudsman Office refers to the High Misdemeanour Court's judgment from January 2016 (that was later confirmed by the Constitutional Court in November 2016) in one of the recent cases:

"It is an undisputable fact that the slogan was used as official greet of Ustashe movement and totalitarian regime of the Independent State of Croatia and that it (the greet) was present on all official documents... and (Ustashe movement) was derived from fascism and also it is based on racism ... and it symbolizes hate towards persons of other religious affiliation and ethnic background, manifests racist ideology as well as undermines the crimes against humanities."

Other symbols include the use of letter U with little wings and a cross in between symbolizing the word **Ustashe** and the regime, today popular on cities' facades in a form of graffiti.

This existence of hate symbols that are present in public sphere is also poured in the online public sphere with a lot of examples of online (Facebook) discussions ending with the greeting "Za dom spremni!" (or shortened: "ZDS") but with no reaction of competent authorities whatsoever.

Similarly, another famous example is the "Kill a Serb" (ubi Srbina) phrase.

Historical revisionism, hate speech and violence against Serbs are in fact visible in Croatia's public space. "Kill a Serb/Kill Serbs" (*Ubi Srbina / Ubi Srbe*), "Serbs, get out from Croatia" (*Srbi, odlazite iz Hrvatske*), "Death to Serbs" (smrt Srbima) and "Hang Serbs on willows"(*Srbe na vrbe*) are the most

usual graffiti in public directly calling for persecution or killing of Serbs, who constitute the biggest national minority in Croatia.

In a couple of Croatian towns, stickers were posted in public, reading "Serbian Family Tree" and showing bodies hanging from a tree.

These cases constitute incitement to hatred and violence according to Article 325 of the Penal Code but are never being prosecuted as such, but rather as cases of public disorder. Other racist terms include "obojani" (coloured), "zagoreni" (burnt), "crnčuga", "čamuga" or "niger" (nigger), "crni" (blacks), "kosooki" (slanted eyes), "žuti" (yellow, referring to Asians), "šiptari" (Albanians, derogatory, "cigani" or "cigojneri" (Roma).

In the context of racism and xenophobia, right-wing extremists in **Germany** often claim that there are too many foreigners in Germany who are "crowding out" (German: "Überfremdung") the native population. A similar narrative emerges also in Italy, with direct reference to refugees and asylum seekers. A slogan often used in this context is "Deutschland den Deutschen" (engl.: "Germany to the Germans"). In order to avoid a historically charged and negatively connoted language, the Identitarian Movement coined the term "Remigration", demanding that "illegal" migrants (or people regarded by them as such) should return to their countries of origin. Apart from that, foreigners are also called "parasites" ("Schmarotzer") and are accused of taking advantage of social benefits.

Most recently, as observed by experts in the field, refugees as well as Muslim men and especially Muslim women are most targeted by racist hatred online. Austria has been dealing with a persistent and widespread one-sided narrative about refugees and Muslims, fuelled by reoccurring racist allegations by political parties and well-known (political) decision makers and by the dissemination of one-sided narratives by the media. After the large-scale influx of refugees in 2015, coined by many as "the refugee crisis", now often even coined as the "migration crisis", which initially was accompanied by a "welcome culture", as titled by many, a steep decline of this welcoming atmosphere is to be observed. This up-rise of solidarity and rather positive sentiments shifted into fear of the unknown, a stress on separated groups and a large-scale portrayal of those groups as "impossible to integrate" ("unintegrierbar") and not compatible with so-called "Western values". Foreigners, these days often summed up as refugees and/or Muslims, are often portrayed as being one and the same group of people, connected to adjectives like dangerous, criminal, not compatible with "Western values", not willing to integrate and similar to Germany as "Sozialschmarotzer" ("scroungers"). This dangerously one-sided narrative is strongly fed by political debates about the so-called "Kopftuchverbot" ("headscarf ban"), misuse of social benefits and other one-sided portrayals.

Recently, comments like "let them drown" ("lasst sie ersaufen"), underneath a picture of drowning refugees, or "just shoot" ("einfach erschießen"), below an article about refugees waiting at a fence to cross the border, were striking and alarming. These messages are punishable under Austrian criminal law.

Racist expressions in **Italy** are not only extremely common both in the offline and online world, but some of them have nowadays become socially accepted expressions, and many people use them without even realising that their original meaning is indeed derogatory. For instance, words like "*marocchino*" (Moroccan) or "*senegalese*" (Senegalese) are used in reference to people coming from the MENA region (hence not only Moroccan) and people coming from sub-Saharan Africa (without them necessarily being from Senegal) respectively, hence generalising a number of stereotypes related to

them with no critical thinking. By the same token, if something is *cinese* (Chinese) it is automatically cheap and of poor quality.

Foreigners who are poor or perceived as such are called *extracomunitari* (literally "from outside the Community", referring to the old name of the European Union, i.e. to refer to third-country Nationals), but this term is often used also to refer Romanians, who are instead EU Citizens.

More discriminatory words are "vu cumprà" (literally "wanna buy") used for foreigners who sell cheap products at the beach or in the city centre, kebabbaro (kebab seller) used for Arab people, scimmie, orango (apes, orangutan) for Africans (as well as negro, nigger), up to expressions like bestie, or animali (beasts, animals).

In **Slovenia**, hateful words and expressions vary according to the real or perceived origin of the targeted minority. When negatively talking about people from MENA region, there is usually an emphasis on their "backwardness" in comparison to the people from "civilized" West. Terms as "**opankar**" (sandal-person) or "**barbar**" (barbarian) are used. In connection to that, there is quite some disdainful hate speech linked to the idea of people living with animals and even practicing sodomy — "**kamelotrajbar**" (someone who is dragging camels around) or "**kamelojebec**" (someone who is having sex with camels). Even before the increased flows of migration to Europe of 2015, there was a negative attitude towards North Africa in connection to rejection of migrations. Since only a few people originating from this region live in Slovenia, racist hate speech against them is influenced with the situation in other countries — especially nearby ones such as Italy.

Similarly, racist hate speech against sub-Saharan Africans is used in relation to the black skin colour and linked to the idea of "backwardness" of African people, using words "črnuh" (black person) or "zamorec" (meaning "man behind the sea", but used as "nigger" for black/African people). The term "opica" (monkey) may be also used in a disdainful way. The Slovenian partner has also identified the word "dolgokurčni", meaning "the long-dick one". Nonetheless, this form of hate speech is not wide-spread as not many people from sub-Saharan Africa live in Slovenia. This is also the case for Asians, where only few hateful words are in use: "rumenkar" or "rumenokožec" (yellow-skinned person). Sometimes when people see a person with Asian-like features (especially eyes), they ignorantly label them as "Chinese".

Conversely, hate against people coming from former Yugoslavia is widespread in **Slovenia**, mainly because of historical and cultural background. These people are insulted and treated as inferior, stereotypically marked as more violent and less civilized or intelligent as Slovenes. The expression "čefur" was first used as an insult for people with background in ex-Yugoslavia republics, but later young generations began to use it in a less stigmatized way or even to mean "cool". It is still used as a negative term in xenophobic speech, including the slogan "čefurji raus" ("ex-Yugoslavia migrants out"), but other expressions are also used, for example "južnjak" (Southerner). Some right-wing politicians, media and online commentators use the mocking term "trenirkar" (tracksuit-person) for those migrants, since the stereotype about them is wearing the tracksuit.

As a special category, we can classify the attitude towards people migrating from Albania and/or Kosovo, called "*šiptarji*" (Shquiptar), also by themselves. Their migrations to Slovenia are still quite common so some Slovenes and other ex-Yugoslavia migrants are spreading hateful attitude against them, turning the term "*šiptar*" into a negative one or transforming it into even more disdainful "šipac", mocking them because of their language, origin, looks etc.

Moreover, there is another range of based more specifically on the origin on the person, namely about their specific nationality: "bosandžero" (disdainful for Bosnian), "Srbe na vrbe" (Serbs on willows - implicating that Serbs should be hanged; first used in a song by a Slovene poet, later widely spread among Croats and some Slovenes to express hatred towards Serbs), "Hrvat je tat" (Croat is a thief). This is strongly connected to the historical facts of former Yugoslavia. Some insults are still linked to the war expressions, with war crimes still being glorified or denied. Expressions used in connection to this aspect are: "Ustaš" (Ustasha; Croatian fascist and nationalist movement, may be used as an insult for Croats, but, as it was previously mentioned, for nationalist Croats themselves is used to glorify their nationalism), "Četnik" (Chetnik; Serbian nationalist movement, may be used as an insult for Serbs, but also by Serbian nationalists themselves for glorifying their nationalism), "nož, žica, Srebrenica" (knife, wire, Srebrenica - known fascist slogan used to glorify Serbian massacre in Srebrenica, expressing hate towards Bosnian Muslims).

Racist hate speech in **Latvia** reflects the widespread prejudices about dark-skinned people – such as their violent nature, proclivity to rapes, expressing fear of race mixing, a call to keep the state racially clean. Dark-skinned people are named as "pērtiķi," (monkeys), "primāti" (primates), even "cilvēkēdāji" (cannibals). There are calls to sterilize them, extradite or not let them in the state. Women in relationships with dark-skinned men are strongly condemned.

The manifestations of xenophobia towards immigrants, refugees, asylum seekers and Muslims grew in 2014 and 2015 in connection with the increased migration flows in Europe and the planned relocation of asylum seekers to Latvia as well as to other countries. Hate speech is often expressed without making a clear distinction between the aforementioned groups. Since 2015 there is an anti-migrant Facebook group "Latvijas nav iebrauktuve" (Latvia is not a place everyone can enter) with more than 13,000 followers.

2. Anti-Semitism

Antisemitism originates from a certain perception of Jews, which may be expressed as hatred toward Jews. Rhetorical and physical manifestations of antisemitism are directed toward Jewish or non-Jewish individuals and/or their property, toward Jewish community institutions and religious facilities. In addition, such manifestations could also target the state of Israel, conceived as a Jewish collective.

Antisemitism frequently charges Jews with conspiring to harm humanity, and it is often used to blame Jews for "why things go wrong". It is expressed in speech, writing, visual forms and action, and employs sinister stereotypes and negative character traits.

Main trends of antisemitism in **France** are: promotion of far-right "traditional" anti-Semitic speech, denialism and revisionism of the Holocaust; promotion of conspiracy theories with the same mechanism "Jews" are responsible for the most tragic social event; anti-Zionism theories hiding sometimes a real antisemitism; proliferation of the concept of the "double standards" popularized in France by the "fascist-sphère". It is often quite violent: murders (Ilan Halimi's murder, Ozar Hatorah's murders and in 2018 Mireille Knoll's murder), violent attacks, etc.

Online, anti-Semitic content are quite popular: with the concept of **Shoax** (Holohoax), "**Shoananas**" and "**memorial pornography**" used by the facist-sphere like Alain Soral and his website "Egalité et reconciliation", the comedian Dieudonné or Hervé Ryssen; with the anti-Zionist trend quite close to antisemitic theories with the use of "**sale sioniste**" ("fucking Zionist"). The name of a famous French Jewish family "**Rothschild**" is also used in the antisemitic rethoric. Since some months, the antisemitic rethoric also includes the figure of Georges Soros (who is subject to multiple accusations of orchestrating a Jews-led conspiracy and gain control over the global economy). The concept of "mafia Juive" (Jewish mafia) is also quite popular.

According to the Federation of Jewish Communities in the **Czech Republic**, this country is perceived to be safe for Jews, where most people have neutral attitudes regarding their presence.³ The number of anti-Semitic incidents has been low and relatively stable over time, but there has recently been an increase in such incidents on the Internet. In addition to the usual ant Semitic tropes (i.e. that Jews are to blame for all the wrongs in society, that they have secret powers to make crucial decisions, that they are greedy and dangerous) there is a new connection between anti-Semitic speech and the recent challenges posed by the migration flows into Europe (which have provoked a lot of hate and anger in the Czech Republic even though very few migrants have actually entered Czech territory) in which Jews are accused of "orchestrating" the movement of Muslim refugees in order to "flood and destroy" Europe. These trends are reflected by the words **Židáci** (kikes); **židobolševici** (Bolshevik Jews); **židozednáři** –(Judeo-Masonic conspiracy).

In **Germany**, antisemitism online can be often observed in the context of conspiracy theories, historical revisionism and holocaust denial. Historical revisionists dub the German culture of remembrance a "cult/religion of guilt" ("*Schuldkult*"), meant to break the German vigorousness and to realise the alleged plan to weaken or even annihilate the German people. In addition to this, they argue that the Holocaust is a made up story by the Jews to oppress the Germans, a so-called "*Holo-Hoax*". To underpin this historical-revisionist conspiracy theory authors refer for example to the so called "*Hooton Plan*" or even cite "The Protocols of the Elders of Zion" ("*Protokolle der Weisen von Zion*") and thereby draw the anti-Semitic picture of Jews striving for world domination.

In **Austria**, as well as Germany, it is noticeable how Nazism influenced terms and phrases which still have an impact on the rhetoric applied today, when it comes anti-Semitic (online) hate speech. This recycling of Nazi-rhetoric seems not only to be occurring when it comes to anti-Semitic speech, but also concerning hatred against Roma/Romnja and Sinti/Sintize, hatred against persons with disabilities and other coined groups, which were targeted during the holocaust and the Nazi-regime.

Also in the Austrian context, comments, denying that the holocaust ever happened, are to be found on the internet, stating e.g. that "concentration camps were only labour camps" ("Konzentration-slager waren nur Arbeitslager"), by saying "Hitler did a good job" ("Hitler hat alles gut gemacht") or "Mauthausen should have never been closed" ("Mauthausen hätte nie zusperren sollen"). Often, when it comes to anti-Semitic hate speech in Austria, the word "Jew" is combined with the word "sow",

³ http://www.fzo.cz/wp-content/uploads/V%C3%BDro%C4%8Dn%C3%AD-zpr%C3%A1va-o-projevech-antisemitismu-v-%C4%8Cesk%C3%A9-republice-za-rok-2015.pdf

a rhetoric that has been existing for many years and has been strongly framed and enshrined in the pre-World War II era as well as during the Second World War.⁴

When scanning the internet for anti-Semitic hate speech, long-existing prejudices are continuously reinstated, by portraying persons as being "greedy" ("gierig"), "not paying taxes" ("die Zahlen keine Steuer!!!!" [sic!]) Anti-Semitic hate speech is not only spread via text, but also Memes and GIFs are shared on various platforms and in social media groups.

Antisemitism is a low profile, albeit steady form of intolerance in **Italy**; in particular, while reported cases of anti-Semitic hate crimes have decreased in the recent years, online hate speech against the Jews is on the rise⁵. Prejudices against the Jews are so common that the mere word **ebreo** (Jew) is a widely recognised synonyms for being **tirchio** (stingy), and it is used by people who may not be anti-Semitic themselves (e.g. you can easily hear someone saying "the owner of this shop/market is a bit Jewish" i.e. this place is expensive).

Jews are commonly referred to as *strozzini, usurai* (loan sharks), yet this narrative is more common in the offline rather than online world.

On social media, racist and xenophobic groups praise the re-opening of the Auschwitz camps and it is common to find the sentence "*riaprire i forni*" ("let's re-open the ovens/crematories"). Recently, during a gathering of extreme-right and nostalgic groups, an affiliate of the far-right movement "*Forza Nuova*" wore a t-shirt with the inscription "Auschwitzland", with the famous Walt-Disney font⁶. This triggered a strong public outcry. So far, only the Museum of Auschwitz pressed charges against her, but more will probably follow from national Jewish Associations.

Lastly, the financial crisis that hit Europe during the last years contributed to the re-emerging of the historical conspiracy theory according to which a global Jewish alliance is secretly operating to take control of the new world order by taking power over the global political and financial world.

Anti-Semitic discourse in **Slovenia** and **Croatia** is very limited. The only widely used disdainful expression is the term "žid" (Jew) itself, used similarly to Italy for describing a greedy person, even if he or she is not a Jew at all. It follows the stereotype about Jews being greedy, impolite, and rich, which is widely accepted and believed in the Slovenian public. Some people also believe and share the conspiracy theory about Jews controlling the economy and international relations between countries, as it happens in many other countries, which also makes them guilty for the injustice and wars. A form of antisemitism also present to some extent is genocide denial, as in Germany and France.

Anti-Semitic hate speech in **Latvia** is also based on historically formed myths and prejudices about the Jews. The most widespread anti-Semitic myth relates to the Nazi propaganda about "*zīdu boļševisms*" (Jewish Bolshevism) when Jews were being blamed for terror against the local population by stressing that the number of Jews was proportionally high among the soviet officials who issued decrees about

⁴ Cases of Antisemitic on- and offline attacks in Austria, can be looked up in the Antisemitism Report, published by the Forum Against Antisemitism. https://www.fga-

wien.at/fileadmin/user upload/FgA Bilder/Berichte/Antisemitismusbericht-2017 FgA.pdf [17.11.2018]

⁵ CDEC. "Rapporto sull'antisemitismo in Italia nel 2016" (2017)

⁶https://bologna.repubblica.it/cronaca/2018/10/28/news/_auschwitzland_sulla_tomba_di_mussolini_a_preda ppio-210214778/

the deportations of Latvians to Gulag camps during the Soviet occupation in 1941. ⁷ Conspiracy theory such as the desire of Jews to rule over the world is also commonly referred to. Anti-Semitic comments tend to occur in relation to the restitution of Jewish communal property and, as in Germany, financial scandals. At present, Jews in Latvian officially are called "*ebreji*". Word "*žīdi*" was used historically in Latvian language, but it gained negative and derogatory meaning in Nazi propaganda

3. Anti-Muslim hatred

In **France**, this phenomenon is mainly based on the stigmatization of Muslims, and as such, anti-Muslim racism is an affront to human rights and dignity of all Muslims.

One element which is worth repeating concerns the overlapping character of hate against Muslims, Arab people and refugees; as most people do not distinguish between the three groups, and, in some cases, there is intersectionality among them.

The arrival of people from Africa or Middle East are perceived as a "colonization of Europe" linked to a **Muslim conquest of Europe**. For example, Robert Ménard, Mayor of the city of Béziers, declared in a TV interview and on the social networks that the theory of the "great replacement" developed by Renaud Camus (2011) was confirmed by the "proportion of Muslim children" in classrooms⁸.

There is also a polarized political debate on "far-right" ideas such as immigration, integration, "laïcité" and Islam. The question of wearing hijab in universities, work place, etc., has been recurring and tend to stigmatize Muslim women wearing the hijab who became one the main targets of anti-Muslim hatred. "Fatmas" for women, "Muzz" for Muslims or negative use of Arabic surnames as for example "Mohamed" transformed in "Mohamerde" (Play word with the term "merde" = shit), "Mouloudes", etc. The other key-element in Anti-Muslim hatred in France is the connection between Muslim people and terrorist attacks.

Anti-Muslim hate (more commonly known here as Islamophobia) has been steadily rising in the **Czech Republic** over the last five years and reached its peak with the migrants who crossed into Europe in 2015. Muslims are confused with Arabs here, and generally being a Muslim is stereotypically connected with being a "terrorist", a "danger", an "invader", a "conqueror" and part of a movement to "destroy-civilization". Although traditionally antigypsyism has been the strongest form of hate in the country, over the last five years anti-Muslim hate has become even more prominent. Muslim men are accused of being "paedophiles", "zoophiles", of being "diseased" or "perverted" and of being "dangerous to women". Muslim women are seen as "dangerous" and "backward" if they decide to wear the headscarf. According to the Islamophobia reports for the years 2017, 2016 and 2015, anti-Muslim hate is the strongest online, where in addition to constant attacks on all Muslims, there are many hoaxes disseminated about them. Terrorist attacks are presented online as "natural" for Muslims, and all

⁷ <u>Latvijas Cilvēktiesību centrs (2015)</u>, <u>Antisemītisma izpausmes: vēsture un mūsdienas, available at:</u> <u>http://cilvektiesibas.org.lv/media/attachments/21/01/2016/antisemitisma brosura.pdf</u>

⁸ https://www.20minutes.fr/justice/2237735-20180314-beziers-robert-menard-relaxe-apres-propos-enfants-musulmans-ecoles

⁹ <u>http://www.islamophobiaeurope.com/</u>

Muslims are considered collectively responsible for them. It is sometimes difficult to separate anti-Muslim from anti-refugee hate. Muslims are threatened online with being locked up in concentration camps. The small number of ethnic Czech Muslims, many of whom may not be visibly Muslim, are often targeted for harassment: words like *kozomrd* – goatfucker; *slimak* – slug and *mohamedán* – derogatory term for followers of Mohamed, are commonly found on the Internet.

A peculiar case is that of **Croatia**, where some anti-Muslim hatred terms (*muslići* - Muslims in diminutive; *balije* - a term used to describe descendants of Turks of Ottoman empire in the Balkans and also used in a derogatory way to call anyone who is a Bosnian Muslim or considers themselves an ethnic Bošnjak) are used commonly for Bosnian national minority - one of the 24 national / ethnic minorities recognized in the Constitution. Muslims living in Croatia who are from Bosnia (non-denominational Muslims and Sunni Muslims) are well integrated and have their political, social and economic rights guaranteed by the Constitutional Law on the Rights of the National Minorities, as well as by other legal documents defining the use of language and writings, education in the language and script of the national minority as well as representation in bodies at the state and local levels. Islam is the third religion and the right of practicing religion in mosques is secured and in practice. No hate crime incidents were reported in the last couple of years towards Muslims in this context. Only in the beginning of 2017, unknown perpetrator smeared a ball of lard across the two obituaries in Zagreb neighbourhood of Borongaj provoking on the fact that Muslims do not consume pork and pork products. This minor but ridiculous and disappointing event was condemned by many citizens on social networks but no official condemnation was made.

Other pejorative and offensive term used for Muslims is "obrezani" (circumcised, after the practice of circumcision of boys).

On the other hand, Muslims coming from Middle-East as refugees or migrants have different status in Croatian society and different terms apply to them. Mostly these terms are shared with the category anti-migrant hatred and these include: "teroristi" (terrorists), "isilovci" (ISIS fighters), "vehabije" (Wahhabi, after Muhammed Abdulwahab, reformer of Islam from Saudi Arabia), "muhamedovci" (English for Mohammed, after the prophet Mohammed). Women who are migrants and refugees are referred to as pejorative "nindže" (ninjas, referring to women wearing burqas) or "zamotane" (English for 'wrapped', also referring to wearing burqas or simply being covered by a headscarf).

Anti-Muslim hatred in **Germany** is closely connected to hate against refugees. Muslims are generally associated with extremists and terrorists. They are especially targeted with hate speech when openly showing religious symbols (e.g. derogatively calling women wearing headscarf "*Kopftuchmädchen*" i.e. "headscarf girls"). Fake news are spread under the topic of "crimes committed by foreigners" to frame migrants, but especially Muslims and refugees, as "terrorists" and "rapists". Supposed "revelations" of crimes committed by Muslims or migrants promote the image of a weak state and law enforcement, wrong asylum policy and defenseless "German people". Muslims are also defamed as "scum" ("*Muslimabschaum*") or zoophil ("*Eselficker*", "*Ziegenficker*"). Furthermore, Islam is portrayed as a religion of violence which is incompatible with German culture and liberal democracy. This is often expressed by wryly calling it a religion of peace ("*Religion des Friedens*") in a context that is clearly meant to allege the opposite. Right-wing extremists also cite propaganda material of Islamist terrorist organisations like the "IS" to support this claim.

Anti-Muslim (online) hatred has recently been a strikingly frequent form of hate speech in **Austria**, often merged with hate speech targeting refugees and especially often also going hand in hand with misogynist hate speech, targeting women, who are visibly Muslim by wearing a headscarf. Here the rhetoric ranges from "without headscarf she wouldn't be that ugly" ("ohne Kopftuch wäre sie nicht so schirch" to "she has probably lice underneath her cloth" ("die hat sicher Läuse unter dem Tiachl") to "ick, take that cleaning cloth off your head. It is so unhygienic" ("Würg, zieht doch erst einmal den Putzlappen vom Kopf").

One incident, showing the potentially insane intensity of Anti-Muslim (online) hatred, was particularly alarming. After a woman gave birth to her child on New Year's morning, being the first-born baby in the city of Vienna in 2018, a picture of the family was posted online as well as published in online newspapers, which quickly thereafter led to a remarkable controversy, consisting of numerous comments like e.g. "The next terrorist is born" ("*Der nächste Terrorist geboren*"). Generally, persons perceived to be Muslims must frequently deal with being associated with "terrorism". This narrative his currently widespread in Austria.¹⁰

Anti-Muslim hatred in **Italy** focuses predominantly on the (alleged) long term negative consequences of the increasing presence of the Muslim population in the country. It includes the threat posed against the traditional Christian family, as for instance the impossibility to display Christian symbols in public schools and offices so that the sensitivity of the Muslim minority is not hurt (it should be noted that Italy is, by Constitution, a lay country, therefore religious symbols should not be displayed in public places anyways). Another narrative concerns the utter opposition of some shares of the population to the building up of Mosques, as they are believed being centres of radicalisation, training and brainwashing for potential terrorists. Muslims are referred to as **tagliagole** (slitting throats) **cammelli** (camels) and, more broadly, **terroristi**, **jihadisti** (terrorists, jihadists).

In **Slovenia**, anti-Muslim hate gained its extensiveness with anti-refugee hate that developed mostly during the refugee migrations to Europe in 2015. Before that, it was also widespread in connection to the debates about building a mosque in Ljubljana. Recently (in 2016), hateful discourse against Muslims developed into actions when pig heads with pig blood were placed at the mosque construction site in Ljubljana. Main hate speech characteristic is labelling Muslims (also using the expression "*muslič*") as dangerous, uncivilized, too different and unable to integrate in our – "Christian", Slovenian and/or European- society. Hate is being legitimized by emphasizing alleged or possible extremism of Muslims, also with certain expressions to address all Muslims ("Islamist", "Jihadist", "Vahabit", and "Salafist"). It goes together with reproducing the stories and images of violent and cruel acts by some actual Muslim extremists. Their actions are being generalised to all Muslims, especially refugees. One aspect of it is labelling Muslims as terrorists, showing them as a potential threat to Europe especially in the aftermath of the Paris attacks. All that is being packed in an idea of Islam being an aggressive religion by itself, emphasizing its "aggressive principles and practices" (for example we could hear quite some warnings about Islam being cruel to homosexuals, women and other minority and marginalized groups).

_

¹⁰ Cases of Anti-Muslim hatred in Austria can be looked up in the annual report on Anti-Muslim racism, published by the Dokustelle – Islamfeindlichkeit und antimuslimischer Rassismus. Available here: https://www.dokustelle.at/ [17.11.2018]

The other aspect is condemning some Muslim practices, as for instance, wearing the burqas in public. While not being concerned about gender equality in other areas, this practice is attacked as "woman rights violation". Fears are being spread that "we cannot know who is under the burqa". Based on this, disdainful or mocking expressions as "rjuharica" (sheet-woman), "zadekanec" (blanket-man), "hidžbaba" (hijab-woman) or "burkbaba" (burqa-woman) are used, sometimes with threats and calls for violence against them. Also, some other expressions are used for mocking the differences, such as "obrezanec" (circumcised person).

Anti-migrant speech with specific anti-Muslim features has also increased against the growing number of foreign students in **Latvia**. Students from Pakistan, Afghanistan and India are often associated with kebab food restaurants, linking those with illegal employment, crimes committed by migrants, and public threat.

4. Anti-refugee hatred

Anti-refugee hatred became popular in **France** with the so-called "refugee crisis" of 2016: the situation in Calais, in Menton/Vintimille and the Roya valley and in the Alps, shanty towns in the North and the East of Paris.

Fake stories (e.g. refugees are rapist of white women) are promoted on social networks: some places in France are now **Africa** (cf: Nadine Morano about the "Gare du Nord" in Paris¹¹).

As for the anti-Muslim hatred, the concepts of "invaders", of "crusade", of "colonization", of "great replacement" and of "migratory submersion" are constantly associated to refugees and exiled people. Refugees and exiled people are considered as "migrants", as "vermin", and are compared to insects and animals which can be killed. There is also a hunting rhetoric around "migrants".

Anti-refugee hate reached its peak in 2015/2016 during the big migration wave in Europe. Refugees are not welcome in the **Czech Republic**, whether officially or by the broader society. They are seen as "economic migrants" at best and as "conquerors" at worst. They are often the subjects of online hoaxes and almost no distinction is drawn between asylum-seekers, migrants, and persons enjoying refugee status. Police responded, for example, to what a Facebook user described as a "bunch of illegal migrants the authorities are hiding from us", but discovered that the people who were being reported on were Romani residents of Slovakia who were actually returning to that neighbouring EU Member State, not "illegal migrants" or "refugees" in any sense. Refugees are also referred to as "vermin" and are accused of spreading diseases, being "dirty", "dangerous" and as inherently, even congenitally "unable" to live in Czech society. The assumption is that no refugee from Africa or Asia, no Muslim, and no Romani people can ever integrate into Czech society and that therefore they will only ever be able to be "parasites". The issue of so-called "welfare chauvinism" is often recalled in this context, according to which the welfare state should just benefit nationals, and refugees, therefore, will only abuse welfare and never contribute to creating wealth in society. Therefore, the hateful narrative

16

¹¹ https://www.lopinion.fr/video/ca-fait-buzz/nadine-morano-se-lache-gare-nord-c-est-l-afrique-103185

against them is built of words like *paraziti* (parasites); *primitivove* (primitives); *zneužívají dávky* (abuse social benefits).

Anti-refuges terms used in **Croatian** language are related to anti-migrant hatred, which is also related to anti Muslim hatred that is increasing since 2015 and the opening of the Balkan route. These terms include depictions of migrants as terrorists ("teroristi"), members of ISIS ("isliovci") and occupiers ("okupatori"). There is an increase in using the term "kozojebi" (goatfuckers) on social media when speaking derogatory of Muslims coming to Croatia as refugees and migrants.

In **Germany**, it is closely connected to anti-Muslim hatred. Refugees are generally believed to be Muslims and at the same time Muslims and people of Arab origin are usually seen as migrants, irrespective of how long they have been living in Germany.

Prejudices and stereotypes of refugees have reached the general public in Germany. It is no longer only right-wing extremists who call for violence against refugees. Especially in the aftermath of the sexual assaults on women during the New Year's Eve 2015/2016 in Cologne, refugees are stigmatized as "rapists" — a stereotype specifically disseminated under the hashtag #rapefugees. Another stereotype of refugees is that of "invaders" ("Invasoren") trying to "replace" the German people. At the same time refugees are accused of coming to Germany to take advantage of social benefits ("Asylschmarotzer"/ "Asylforderer").

As mentioned before, anti-refugee hatred has recently been interlaced with Anti-Muslim hatred and general racist hatred in **Austria**. Comments were reported to organizations dealing with (online) hate speech and discrimination, ranging from "fucking dogs, those shitty dirty refugees "("Scheißhunde diese verschissenen Drecksflüchtlinge!") to "I will slaughter a Muslim" ("einen Musel werde ich abschlachten"), "they have no place here on Christian grounds" ("die haben auf christlichen [sic!] Boden nichts verloren)", to "this savage riff-raff should be forbidden here" ("dieses Gesindel gehört verboten").

Similarly, in **Italy**, anti-refugee hate on the internet is built on a solid body of fake news, decontextualized images and videos of immigrants and rather improbable statements allegedly made by left-wing politicians positively open towards migration. The main rhetoric tries to overcome those who claim that migration is indeed a resource for the country (both economic and cultural) and a positive contribution to our economy, by denouncing every single (real of fake) episode of violence and trouble involving newly arrived migrants. These episodes, when shared on the Internet, lead to a huge amount of hateful and violent comments. Haters then ironically call migrants *risorse preziose* (precious resources) to underline how this concept is for them ridiculous. Hate is then expressed through sentences like "*prendiamo i fucili*" (*let's take the rifles*), "*bombe*" (bombs).

In line with the other countries, anti-refugee hate can be hardly separated from anti-Muslim hate in **Slovenia**. The assumption is that refugees represent the danger of "islamization" of Europe. In recent years the issue of migration became overrepresented in politics, media and public discourses, which are often spreading fear, discomfort or even hate. When the "Balkan route" was established, the situation was less tense and solidarity prevailed in public discourses. With the time however more and more warnings were expressed about "too high" numbers of refugees coming through Slovenia that "cannot be controlled", creating fear of "overflowing us". Expressions as "*poplava beguncev*" (flood of refugees), "*invazija*" (invasion), and "*horde beguncev*" (hordes) emerged. They were also labelled as "illegal migrants", with no right to come to Europe because they are "in fact" economic migrants

and not refugees. Hate was legitimised with refugees being shown as people who don't actually need our help but are just faking it, even called "paraziti" (parasites) because they are allegedly "taking our money" when "Slovene families need it more". Such opinions were directly legitimised, since representatives of the government spoke about migrants only in security context and ordered a construction of a razor wired fence on the border.

There are some slogans that are very typical for far right and neo-Nazi groups, based on the glorification of Slovenia, ideologically separating Slovenes from "others", who are shown in negative way or even as a threat. The most common are "Slovenijo Slovencem" (Slovenia to Slovenes), "tukaj je Slovenija" (here is Slovenia), "mi, Slovenci" (we, Slovenes – emphasizing Slovenian origin of themselves). Even some militant language developed, calling to fight for Slovenia and "protect" or "defend" it: "v boj, v boj za narod svoj" (fight, fight for our nation) or "ubranimo"/"zavarujmo Slovenijo" (defend Slovenia; mostly in context in which immigrants are shown as threat to "our nation, culture, religion etc.") - very common after refugee migrations 2015.

Arrival of migrants and refugees to Europe is perceived also in **Latvia** as an invasion, colonisation, Islamisation, Africanisation of Europe, and burden on the welfare system. It is sometimes linked to the white-supremacists ideology and the so-called "white genocide." George Soros is frequently blamed for planning the invasion of migrants from Middle East and African countries to Europe with an aim to destroy Europe. Hate speech is addressed towards those organisations and individuals that have received Soros funding, as well as support the rights of migrants. Migrants and refugees from the Middle East and North African countries are associated with terrorism, rape of European women, and zoophilia – *terrostisti* (terrorists), *džihādisti* (jihadis), *kazu drazēji* (goat fuckers). There are frequent calls to prevent the arrival of migrants to Europe by sinking their boats (*nogremdēt laivas*), shooting (atšaut) and exterminating (iznīcināt) them.

5. Antigypsyism

In the **French** context, it has to be firstly noted that the Gypsy, the Roma and the Travelling community are one of the minorities mostly misunderstood and rejected by the rest of the population. One important element is that these communities are not homogeneous: it refers to different groups with their own traditions, religions, History and legal status as for example the Travelling community (In French, "Les gens du voyage"), the Gypsies (In French, "Les gitans"), the Manouche ("Les Manouches") - and the Roma who constitute a migrant group from Romania, Bulgaria, etc.

Roma people are considered as "little" robbers, as vagabonds, as beggars (with false disabilities, with tricks, etc.), as homeless exploiting their own children who came to France for taking advantages of the social aids system. The so-called Roma camps are often linked to the resurgence of violence, delinquency and smuggling in the local neighborhoods. Similarly, travelers live "out of the system" but they take advantages of "the system" by exploiting all the social aids system. They live by stealing and smuggling, one of the common racist insult is "chicken thieves" ("Voleurs de poules" in French). Finally, they are considered by a lot of municipalities or private owners of illegally occupying lands.

Antigypsyism is the most common type of hate in the Czech Republic. Romani people are a national minority with recognized rights under both domestic and international law, but they have been constantly subjected, both historically and currently, to hate and marginalization. Even Romani people who are Czech citizens are perceived by many non-Roma as "foreigners". Again, the environment of the Internet has brought to light many aspects of that hatred as well as its intensity. In addition to Romani people being subjected to constant threats of violence, they are constantly accused of being "parasites" or "thieves", of "excessively" procreating, of being "dirty", "dangerous", or "untrustworthy" - and despite all of this, as being also somehow "privileged" by the state and by society. Some Roma-related hoaxes are in what seems to be eternal circulation both offline and online, refuted by the authorities many times but still reoccurring (for example, rumours that Roma receive higher welfare benefits than other groups do, or that they do not have to pay for prescription drugs, etc.). Roma are called "black" in Czech, but the most-used code word for them is nepřízpůsobiví or "inadaptable", a term with its origins in the Nazi era referring to persons who are considered congenitally incapable of ever conducting their lives in a "regular" way. Other words are *Opálení* (suntanned); *cikán* (Gypsy); nemakačnekové (those who never work). Unlike members of other groups, Romani people are consistently marginalized and attacked both offline and online.

"Cigani" is in Croatia a derogatory term used for Roma in various ways – to negatively define public figures as corrupted, portraying Roma as thieves, dirty and cheap.

Roma/Romnija and Sinti/Sintize are one of the most marginalized population groups in **Germany**. Although they are represented by the Central Council of German Sinti and Roma (Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma), it took a long time until minority rights were fully accepted and the atrocities against them during the Second World War were recognised as genocide. Still, to this day Roma/Romnija and Sinti/Sintize have to fight with everyday racism and stigmatization, mainly based on the stereotype of being "gypsies" ("*Zigeuner*"), "nomads" or "travelling people" leading an unstable life ("*Rotationseuropäer*"). Sinti and Roma families are often described as "gangs of beggars" or "gangs of thieves" ("*Bettlerclan*"; "*Diebesbande*") and accused of taking advantage of the German social system. Reports about so-called "junk properties" (German: "*Schrottimmobilien*") are used to suggest that Sinti and Roma are generally 'dirty' and 'insanitary' and responsible for the derelict state of the buildings. Hate speech against refugees can not only be found on right-wing pages. Prejudices are sometimes also spread by mass media when they report about issues concerning Roma/Romnija and Sinti/Sintize, albeit in a subtler way and between the lines. However, in the comment sections hate speech is often reinforced and can built up to calls for violence and murder.

In **Austria**, organisations documenting (online) antigypsyist hate speech, like the ROMANO CENTRO or ZARA — Zivilcourage und Anti-Rassismus-Arbeit, have recently not received a high number of reports when it comes to online hate speech cases. The fact that not many cases are reported does not indicate that there are only few of such cases, though. In general, Austria is facing the issues of high underreporting and the lack of capacity to do thorough monitoring in this regard.

After all, (online) hate speech against Roma/Romnja and Sinti/Sintize does exist, ultimately even visible in public spaces, where the slogan "*Roma RauSS*" ("Get out, Roma" – with capital letter "SS", referring to Nazi special forces) has repeatedly been sprayed/smeared on walls. The discourse is often marked by an immediate reversal of argumentation, arguing that the majority population is the "actual" victim of racism and discrimination, originating from the minority – because of their perceived "special

rights". Striking (online) hate speech ranges from calling persons, perceived as Roma/Romnja "a disgusting people" ("ein ekliges Volk"), "criminal gangs" ("alles kriminelle Banden") to "child abusers" ("Kinderverzahrer").

Antigypsyism in Austria, as drawn from ROMANO CENTRO¹², one of the first Roma/Romnja associations in Austria, (online) hate speech, targeting Romnja/Roma and Sinti/Sintize show a shocking degree of conceptual dehumanisation through positive references to Nazism, instigating murder and extermination fantasies.

Antigypsyism is one of the most diffused types of intolerance also in **Italy**: more than 80% of the population has indeed a negative opinion about the Roma population¹³. The narrative commonly pairs the Roma population with a real or presumed chronical emergency, in particular for what concerns the Roma camps, considered as real hubs of criminal activities, poor hygiene endangering the health standards of the surrounding areas and an utter lack of rules. Online hate speech against Roma is predominantly built on the contraposition of the difficulties faced by the most disadvantaged shares of the Italian population (in terms of housing, food depravation, difficulties to access the health care system, etc.) and the alleged disproportionate social and economic benefits offered to the Roma communities.

There are no specific discriminatory words used against the Roma (albeit the word *zingaro* - gypsy is commonly used as an insult in itself, and can refer to shabby-looking people in general). The anti-gypsy narrative is instead built on a number of general sentences like "*prima gli italiani*" - Italians first (mostly because many haters are not aware of the fact that the majority of the Roma population in Italy actually holds Italian Citizenship), and slogans like "*bruciamo I campi*" (let's burn the camps) or "*via gli zingari da le nostre città*" (gypsys out of the cities). Nonetheless, the most (in)famous word connected to anti-gypsysm is the one used by the current Ministry of Interior and leader of the Northen League, namely *ruspe!* (bulldozer) now used as a slogan to call for the demolition and destruction of the roma camps (indeed, by using bulldozers).

Anti-Gypsysm in **Slovenia** is more common in regions where Roma are present. Other areas contribute less, since they are not in contact with them. There were also cases of politicians talking openly against Roma, and such speech is rather socially acceptable. The general stereotype about Roma is that they steal, they are uneducated, dirty, unadjusted, living in bad conditions (stereotypical "gypsy settlements") and have many children. Expression "**cigan**" (meaning Gypsy) is widely used as an insult for someone with at least one of those characteristics, or not even one – just as a general insult, even if the person is not Roma. They are being mocked, humiliated and despised a lot, not being treated as equal part of society but rather as subordinate "others".

The most widespread narrative towards Roma¹⁴ in **Latvia** is that they are **zāgļi** (*thieves*), **kāprnieki** (*cheaters*) **and nozeidznieki** (*criminals*) in a wider sense. The negative characteristics are often generalised towards the whole Roma population. *Research on Roma portrayal in the media in 2015*, ¹⁵

¹² Romano Centro (2018): Antiziganismus Report. Falldokumentation 2015 – 2017. Available at: http://www.romano-centro.org/downloads/Antiziganismus in Oesterreich 2015-2017 web.pdf [17.11.2018]

¹³ Stokes, B. (2015). Faith in European project reviving. Pew Research Center's Global Attitudes Project, 2.

¹⁴ Oficially there are around 7,000 Roma in Latvia, while Roma NGOs put the numbers at 10-12,000 as many Roma have identified themselves as Latvian.

¹⁵Latvian Centre for Human Rights (2015), Portrayal of Roma in Latvian Media: Summary of Monitoring Results 2013–2014, available at: http://cilvektiesibas.org.lv/media/attachments/01/09/2016/ReflectionofRoma Monitoring_results.pdf

showed that media sometimes portray Roma as offenders, thus reinforcing the negative public perception Roma as criminals. Comments to the publications are predominantly negative, full of stereotypes and hate speech, and are often not linked to the content of the particular material, but express a general negative or offensive opinion.

6. Homophobia

Homophobia is culturally and/or religiously produced fear of or prejudice against homosexuals that sometimes manifests itself in legal restrictions or, in extreme cases, bullying or even violence against homosexuals. Although the suffix phobia generally designates an irrational fear, in the case of homophobia the word instead refers to an attitudinal disposition ranging from mild dislike to abhorrence of people who are sexually or romantically attracted to individuals of the same sex or do not fit into the traditional heteronormative structure of society. Acceptance of everyday hate speech and spreading of "mainstream" stereotypes: in most common homophobic speech, LGBTIQ+ people are considered as mentally and physically ill, who need to be cured.

In **France**, adverse consequences were registered after some legal improvements: "a certain number of homophobic speech has been triggered by what can be considered as positive developments for the LGBTI community", for example the same-sex marriage or the right to adoption¹⁶. One of the main trends of homophobic speech has been the so-called threat against the traditional religious concept of family (one of the main motto is: "un papa, une maman" - a dad, a mum).

This hatred can be decomposed in different types of hate: lesbophobia (against lesbians), gayphobia (against gays), biphobia (against bisexuals) or transphobia (against transsexuals), etc.

Main homophobic insults are "**PD**" or "**pédé**" (faggot) from the term "pederast" which refers to a man who has <u>illegal sex</u> with a <u>young boy</u>. It refers to the presumed inherent deviated part of the homosexuality. In most violent homophobic speech, there is also a connection between homosexuality and pedophilia. Other insults are "**folle**" ("pussy"), "**fiote**" ("poof"), or "**tapette**" ("fairy") referring to the presumed feminine aspect of gays, not considered as virile "real" men: for example, harassment towards gays are perpetrated because stereotype of feeling, speaking and walking manners refer exclusively to women.

Another old insult is "queer", whose actual meaning has been picked up by a part of the LGBTIQ+ community. Now, this past-insult has been turned in a positive affirmation of solidarity, community of sexual identities.

Anti-lesbian insults refer mainly to the stereotype of women not enough feminine considered as "Camionneuse" (truck drivers). Other insults are "gouines" or "goudous" (dyke) (which used to refer to women of poor's reputation, to prostitutes) and "broute-minous" (pussy-eaters).

Open homophobia is not common in **Czech Republic**. However, whenever the LGBT+ community demands equal rights, homophobia increases, and it does so across divisions of ethnicity, gender or religious affiliation. What is characteristic of homophobia, as well as misogyny, is that instances of it rarely occur in isolation but are often part of attempts to discredit speakers with whom the homophobe disagrees. For example, if someone is advocating for accommodating refugees, or to increase

^{16 &}quot;Manifestations of Online Hate Speech", Reports on antisemitic, antiziganistic, homophobic and anti-Muslim hate speech, INACH project, 2017

the degree of tolerance for cultural differences, or speaking against hate, s/he will be accused of being a "faggot" or a "dyke". Commonly used words are **buzna** (faggot); **buzerant** (bugger); **vyjebaný** (fucked up).

In Croatia, the expression "Kill a faggot" (*Ubi pedera*) is also common on social media and/or in public space in a form of graffiti. This phrase is more actively used in June each year as the Pride marches in Croatia are being held. This is also not prosecuted as incitement to hatred and violence according to Article 325 of the Penal Code but rather as public disorder. Other derogatory terms for gay men besides "peder" include: "*peško*" (diminutive of faggot), "*feminizirani*" (feminised man), "*pičkica*" (pussy) and for women: "*lezba*" or "*lezbača*" (lesbian), "*dajkača*" (from anglicized "dyke"), "*ženturača*" (augmentative of woman) and "*muškobanja*" or "*muškarača*" (masculinized woman).

"Peder" is wide spread insult together with "pičkica" often used to portray the opponent as subject with less power and something wrong with him/her.

In **Germany**, LBTIQ people are called "*Schwuchtel*" (faggot) or "*Kampflesbe*" ("battle dyke"), and homosexuality is portrayed as being "unnatural", disgusting and to be fought against. Homophobia is often expressed through memes, using the iconography of the LGBTI-community itself (especially the rainbow flag) to visualize hatred against LGBTI persons and non-heteronormative partnerships. It is insinuated that traditional families and role models have to be protected against an allegedly omnipresent "*Homo-Lobby*". The term "*NoHomo*" is used to very pointedly distance oneself from homosexuality.

In **Austria**, certain homophobic rhetoric has been adopted into day-to-day language. For example, the word "**Schwuchtel**" ("faggot"), as also in the context of Germany, has been used very "casually". Homosexuality is still in many forums, on platforms, channels or in online groups, tied to (mental) illnesses – "they are sick anyways" ("**die sind ja krank**") – or to paedophilia – "all paedophiles" ("**alle pädophil**"). Homophobic rhetoric is often combined with an extraordinary amount of sexualisation, which is to be seen when words like "**Arschficker**" ("bugger") or "**Schwanzlutscher**" ("cocksucker") are used. Lesbians are frequently portrayed as women who just hate men and therefore only have sex with other women because they have to. Throughout research phases, comments similar to this specific one were found: "**Lesben haben ja nur nicht den richtigen Mann gefunden**." ("Lesbian just did not find the right man."). Homophobia is still strongly tied to deeply rooted myths, drawing from theories, saying that HIV/Aids comes from homosexuals and that homosexuality itself is something one can get infected with.

Homophobia is still widely present also in **Italy**. Common prejudices are that male homosexuals are effeminate (*checca*) while female homosexuals who are more masculine (butch) are called *camioniste*. While 25% of the population considers homosexuality a disease¹⁷, there is also a general feeling of intolerance and annoyance towards homosexuals, which leads to discrimination on various grounds (school, university, workplace) as well as some difficulties in finding accommodations or access to public services.

Online hate speech against homosexuals rises in correspondence with events and episodes with high national visibility (e.g. the Gay Pride) or highly debated matters as the recently approved law on civil unions for same sex partnerships. Common words and expressions used on social media and in online comments mostly target male homosexuals, and are *frocio, finocchio, ricchione, rottoinculo* (literally "broken ass"). It is also noteworthy that these insults are often used against non-homosexuals, for mere mocking and attack.

Use of disdainful expressions for homosexuals is widespread and legitimized in the **Slovene** society, especially using "*peder*" and similar words as a general insult for people that are not even homosexu-

¹⁷ Camera dei Deputati – Commissione Jo Cox sull'intolleranza, la xenofobia, il razzismo e i fenomeni di odio (2017)

als. There are many different expressions established for mocking male homosexuals and that is often linked to the idea of them not being "man" enough or being more "lady-like", just because they don't (or just stereotypically don't) follow the "man stereotype". Similar goes for lesbians that are being accused of not being "woman" enough, with expressions such as "*lezbača*" (lesbian, with a derogatory connotation) or "*možača*" (man-like woman). But it seems that men are much more frequently victims of homophobic hate speech.

The peak of homophobia in Slovenia was reached during the political campaigns about the new family law referendum, which would enable gays and lesbians to get married and adopt children. Besides the use of listed insults, there were public media debates that same sex families are not suitable for raising children, how "LGBT lobby" is influencing and damaging our society with its "unhealthy" ideas, about "gender theory" which allegedly forces children to choose their gender, letting children dress in gender neutral clothes, accepting perverted sexual practices etc. In general, there are still some ideas about homosexuality being a disease that should be cured.

Also, in **Latvia**, homophobic hate speech traditionally increases during Pride, as well as political and public discussions about the "morality" clause in Education Law¹⁸ and the regulation of sex-same marriage or partnership. Latvia does not recognise same sex marriage or partnership. Homosexuality is associated with the "invasion" of Western values which endanger the traditional Latvian or Christian values such as the marriage between a man and a woman, family and raising-up children. It is perceived as a disease or mental disorder, perversion and is mixed-up with paedophilia. Hate speech is accompanied by calls to discrimination, isolation of homosexuals from the society, or even violence. Representatives of LGBT are called "*pediņi*" (fagots), "ill", "freaks", accused of spreading HIV and AIDS.

7. Misogyny

In **France**, the term sexism is much more used than the term misogyny. Sexism refers to discriminatory behaviour against women. It is quite trivialized in many fields of French society: school, family, workplace, etc. This discriminatory behaviour is historical and seems to be deeply rooted in attitudes and practices. Main consequences are distinction between men and women while, at the same time, constitutional right of equality between men and women has been adopted decades ago. Sexist acts are stereotypes, "jokes", statements but could also constitute discrimination, violence and murder ("féminicide"). Domestic violence is significant in France: in 2017, 123 women have been murdered due to domestic violence (one woman killed every 3 days) and 225,000 have been victims of domestic violence. Misogynist and sexist attitudes refer to considering women as pleasurable and playing second fiddle in society.

French social media exploded with thousands of examples of predatory behaviour after journalist Sandra Muller used #BalanceTonPorc to denounce a television executive's inappropriate advances. Despite laws against sexual harassment, many French victims hesitated to come forward because they fear their complaints won't be taken seriously. With the social media movement, the number of complaints has increased a lot since the beginning of 2018. However, polemics appeared following

¹⁸ The parliament amended the Education law to require that schools provide "constitutional morality education" to schoolchildren, ensuring they are educated in line with the constitutional definition of marriage as a union between a man and a woman.

the online movement as for example the open public letter co-signed by Catherine Deneuve in January in Le Monde, arguing that the French movement #BalanceTonPorc or "Out Your Pig" had turned into a witch hunt threatening sexual and artistic freedom.

Even if the French #metoo movement has been a breath of fresh air, many antifeminist/sexist online campaigns have been launched. These campaigns, created most of the time in gaming forums, have been quite violent. As for example, in November 2017, Nadia Daam, a French journalist, denounced in a radio show hateful attacks from the gaming forum community "Jeuxvidéos.com" against two feminist volunteers. After her radio chronicle, the same gaming forum known as "forum Blabla 18-25" has launched a cyber-harassment campaign against her: death threats, threats of rape against her and her daughter, hacking of her accounts, creation of account on platforms known for promoting prostitution, etc. The insults are misogynist and racist with the use of the term "Beurette" which refers to a stereotype of the young French woman from Maghreb considered as a "hooker", as a "loose woman" because of her behaviour. It is also a term linked with pornographic vocabulary. Pornographic vocabulary is also used as a basis for insults against women in general: for example, "chienne" (dog), "salope" (bitch), "pute" (whore). Some other insults also refer to the presumed sexuality of women e.g. "mal baisée" (badly fucked), "frigide" (frigid), or connected to supposed feminine diseases e.g. "hystérique" (hysterical).

Misogyny is expressed in the Czech Republic whenever a woman is perceived as transgressing social and cultural boundaries accepted as appropriate for women. This often happens online, and misogyny is deployed not just by "haters", but also by those who believe they are combating the online hatred of others. For example, a leading female Islamophobe appeared during her election campaign wearing a burga to stress her allegation that Muslims would force all women to dress like that if they were ever to come to power in the Czech Republic. The reactions to her stunt online were hateful and misogynistic, suggesting that "ugly women" like her "should" wear the burqa and cover themselves. What happens much more often, however, is that women are punished online by threats of violence, always including rape, if they advocate for unpopular groups or belong to them. In this case, frequently used words are (čubka) cunt; děvka (whore); kunda, pica (cunt). A woman, who took part in a volunteer initiative of citizens providing orientation aid to refugees in the Czech Republic, revealed that she volunteered under the constant threat of physical violence, rape, sexual assault and humiliation for what those intimidating her called her "ugliness". This happens to almost all women working with the subject matters of feminism, support to refugees, migrants or Roma in the Czech Republic. Romani women are particularly vulnerable to misogyny, since general distrust of them as Romani makes them less trustworthy in the eyes of non-Romani society especially when it comes to Romani women's claims of having experienced violence or other victimization. In spite of not being so numerous, Muslim women are also targets of online hate.

Common terms in **Croatia** are "*kurva*" or "*kučka*", meaning "whore", and are used in order to portray a woman that has liberal views on sexuality or is a feminist. Other terms used for lesbians apply to women who do not fall into the gender stereotypes (see above under 6. Homophobia section). In public spaces, women are very sexualised (for instance, on advertisements, (half)naked women's body is a widely used element) but at the same time, women are being condemned because of their sexuality. Examples for condemnation of this kind are mostly present in the sermons given by Catholic church and its bishops, like in an anthological sermon from 2016 where a priest lamented of woman's disobedience which "is expressed in the search for their (women's') rights to equality that erases the differences, so the woman does not want to accept that she is of Adam and not the other way around, that she is the other, and that the man is the first". Another message from the altar also shows the deep patriarchy rooted in Croatian society, as for example - "Women should not indulge in bodily satisfaction before marriage, which has become frequent lately, to try out the future husband. Make sure you do not become 'easy'". "Easy" translates to Croatian slang as "**štraca**" or "**radodajka**" (easy-to-give).

The term "misogyny" usually describes a concrete hatred against women and the assumption that women are inherently inferior to men. This view is very prominent in **Germany** amongst so-called "pick-up artists" (PUA)¹⁹, who also insinuate that women need a "strong protector" who dominates them.

However, misogyny can also describe a structural discrimination of women. In Germany, the term "Sexismus" (sexism) is also often used in this context. Furthermore, misogyny can take the form of an opposition to gender equality and especially to the achievements of feminist movements. This form of misogyny can be described as "antifeminism". Antifeminists portray men as the "victims of feminism" and claim that the emancipation of women led to a discrimination of men. Terms often used in misogynist hate speech include "Feminazi" ("feminist Nazi"), "Emanze" (women's libber), "Fotze" (cunt) and "Schlampe" (slut).

Recently, misogyny has been a topic of public discourse in **Austria**, which can be partly tied to the public discourse within the #metoo movement. Women have increasingly been standing up, declaring their positions, sharing their sexist experiences and even experiences of tremendous sexual violence. Those acts have – among also positive outcomes – led to surprising storms of misogynist hate speech.

As recently shown by a study, published by WEISSER RING (a victim-support organisation in Germany with branches in Austria), the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute for Human Rights and the University of Vienna, 1 out of 3 women and girls, who were surveyed, had already been affected by violence on the internet in their lives.²⁰

Those cases, strongly visible in the public, were cases of persons of the public, who have started to share their experiences with misogynist hate speech, especially online. Female authors, artists, politicians, business women, who are speaking up and are visible throughout Austria, have been dealing with misogynist hate speech, ranging from being reduced to their physical appearance in a negative and sexist way, calling e.g. a well-known politician "fat" after giving birth, being called names like "slut" ("Schlampe"), "bitch", "Fotze" ("quim") to being, e.g., told "let refugees rape you" ("Lass dich von Flüchtlingen vergewaltigen").

Misogyny is seemingly coming to light again. The phenomenon and highly problematic issue, which seemed on certain levels more dealt with as it used to be in the 1950s, 1960s, 1970s or even way before, seems to have surfaced again, most probably also because of the feeling of anonymity on the internet, which makes certain people, with strongly enshrined misogynist viewpoints, think that they can share enraged misogynist hate speech.

The basic common stereotype in **Italy** concerns the allegedly natural "division of roles" between men and women in the society: men being naturally more suitable to take leadership positions then women (both in politics and business), and therefore being responsible to provide for the family. By the same token, men are stereotypically conceived as being less suitable to take care of domestic work. Despite decreasing, there are still widespread prejudices against full-time employed women with children, who would be considered as worse mothers than those with part-time or no job, outside the house.

For these reasons, women are much more discriminated both at school and in the workplace, and the degree of intolerance increases when they cover roles with high visibility (such as politicians, national athletes, singers, actresses, etc.). When women use their public role to raise awareness on different issues (it can span from cruelty on animals to gender equality) online haters usually target them by attacking their physical aspect (*cesso* = ugly, dog; *vacca* = fat) or with general insults as *troia*, *puttana* (slut, whore). Offensive and sexist comments often escalate into severe harassment,

75

¹⁹ i.e. a movement of men whose goal is seduction and sexualsuccess with and access to women ²⁰Gewalt im Netz gegen Frauen & Mädchen in Österreich. Available at: http://www.weisser-ring.at/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/Broschuere-Gewalt-im-Netz.pdf [17.11.2018]

including rape, killing and violence on various grounds. The root causes are partly explained by the traditional role women cover in public life (TV Shows, advertisements, magazines, etc.), where their presence is mostly for mere aesthetic purposes, with a commodification of their bodies and little or no space for intellectual contributions. This contributes to the misperception of women as a private property of men; therefore, whenever they raise their voices, strong and violent opposition (both offline and online) emerges.

In **Slovenia** there are some very disdainful expressions for women that can be surprisingly used as a compliment, too, but very chauvinistic, for example "pička" (cunt or pussy) and "prasica" (bitch). On one hand, women are being very sexualized; on the other hand, their sexuality is being condemned (while that does not happen for men usually) with expressions such as "kurba" (whore), "prasica" (bitch), "radodajka" (likes-to-give) etc. Similar insults for men are instead very hard to find. Chauvinistic jokes are (still) very much socially accepted and widely used.

Over the last few years, hate speech in **Latvia** has been directed against feminists and generally women active in organising support actions for women's rights. The insults are denigrating, they are called "*maukas*" (whores), "*resnas*" (fat), "*neglītenes*" (ugly), considered men haters, etc.

Defenders of "traditional values", including high-ranking politicians, have used sexist language in the discussions on the potential ratification of the Istanbul Convention by Latvia, claiming that it endangers man's role. Some opine that violence against women is exaggerated or sometimes can be justified. Sexist speech is also used against women politicians, by stressing their exaggerated emotionality comparing to men.

8. Hatred against persons with disabilities

Stereotypes against persons with disabilities are widely represented in online hate speech, and also depend on the type of disability. In **France** for example, persons with a mental disability can be victims of stigmatization due to fear and suspicion: they are perceived as dangerous, irresponsible and with an asocial behaviour. Persons with a physical disability can be perceived as unproductive, weak or less qualified.

It is quite interesting to note that terms related to disabilities are used as insults: "*triso*" or "*mongolien*" which refer to persons with Down syndrome is used for insulting people considered as stupid. "*Malade mental*" (mental patient) is used for naming people considered as crazy or dangerous.

In 2017, according to the annual report of the French Ombudsmen (Défenseur des droits), the first criteria of discrimination (in the total of 25 criteria) – mainly in the field of education - was disability $(21, 8\%)^{21}$.

In **Czech Republic**, hate against disabled people rarely happens as a stand-alone cause for attacks, but is raised if a person with a disability says something unacceptable to the online mob. A separate issue is that language referring to disabilities is used to insult people who are not living with a disability, as for instance the words "blbec" – idiot; "tupec" – retard; "kripl" – cripple. The issue of inclusive education in the Czech Republic has proven a minefield in this regard, with politicians at the highest level

²¹ https://www.defenseurdesdroits.fr/sites/default/files/atoms/files/raa2017 num-accessibilite-10.04.2018.pdf

insisting that they do not believe people living with disabilities (whether intellectual or physical) should be educated in the mainstream programmes. Crucially, much of the antigypsyism and racism expressed in the Czech Republic is rooted in ableism, i.e., the notion that some persons are congenitally "inferior" or that persons who are differently abled do not "deserve" access to the same amenities, freedoms and protections for their rights as "able-bodied" or "normal" people do.

Terms under this category in **Croatia** include "*retard*" or "*retardirani*" (both meaning "retarded"), "*psiho*" (psycho), "*kreten*" (moron, person who is under-developed) and usually refer to persons with mental disorders or to portray someone as stupid or his/her argument invalid. Other expressions include "*kripl*" or "*bogalj*" (cripple), "*defektan*" (defective), "*mutavac*" (mute), "*invalid*" or "*invalidn*" (term for person with any kind of disability) that are typically used to negatively characterize persons with physical disabilities.

In the **German** context, prejudice and hatred against the disabled often stem from a hierarchical view reducing people to their (perceived) physical and psychological abilities (ableism). In this view, non-disabled persons are perceived as the norm and seen as superior to "deviant" disabled persons. This perceived inferiority is used as a justification for degradation and discrimination of persons with disabilities.

Terms often used in hate speech against persons with disabilities include "*Spast(i)*" (spastic), "*Behindi*" (derogatory shortening of "*Behinderter*" (person with disabilities) and "*Krüppel*" (cripple). People with Down's syndrome are derogatorily called "*mongoloid*" or "*Mongo*" as this syndrome is often associated with a perceived 'Mongolian' eye shape.

As Germany, Austria continuously deals with the exclusion and downgrading of persons with disabilities, due to unresolved prejudices and the reduction of persons to certain characteristics. Negatively connoted words, which have initially been used to describe persons with disabilities, are nowadays used in everyday language to swear at people, sometimes even in a "humorous" way among friends. As in Germany words like "Spast(i)", ("spastic"), "Mongo" ("mongoloid") or "Behindikindi" (derogatory shortening of "disabled child") are openly used. Often also to playfully tell people that something is negatively perceived, the sentence "that is so disabled" ("das ist so behindert") is commonly used.

It is even more difficult to summarize online hatred trends, when it comes to online hatred against persons with disabilities, than with other forms of online hatred, as those organisations dealing with discrimination and online hatred in Austria, are for the most part dependent on the reporting of cases of those affected. For this reason, there is very little knowledge about online hatred targeting persons with disabilities. Underreporting might be explained by a lack of empowerment among those who might be affected by it. Nevertheless, the aforementioned words are to be found in various occasions in internet forums, platforms or in online groups.

Hate against people with disabilities is to some extent different from the other types of online hate against minorities. In **Italy**, online hate speech targeting people with disabilities is in general quite rare, yet there are often cases of children with disabilities who are victims of cyberbullying: they are mocked, harassed and derided by their peers at school, and these acts are often recorded and shared on social media platforms and chats. What is worrisome is that when these episodes trigger public outcry, it can

happen that the parents of the perpetrators justify their children by saying that these actions are "only" stupid stunt, hence underestimating the severity of these discriminations.

Another aspect is that hateful language related to disability is often used to offend and attack people who do not have any disability, e.g. *nano* (dwarf) to offend short people, *down, mongolo, spastico, handicappato* to attack allegedly ugly and stupid people. One recent example concerns the leader of the 5 Stars Movement, Beppe Grillo, who ironically accused other opposing politicians of being autistic and of having the Asperger syndrome²², triggering strong reactions from parents' associations and groups promoting the rights of autistic people and children.

Most of the disability-related insults commonly used in **Slovenia** are derived from mental disorders and are used as a general insult, implicating that the addressed person is stupid, even though he or she does not have an intellectual disability. Examples of these insults are "mongloid" (mongoloid), "debil" (slightly mentally disabled child), "kreten" (physically and mentally under-developed person) etc. These insults are widespread, with speakers usually being unaware of their background meaning - an actual disability. The opposite goes for the expressions for physical disabilities – those are mostly used as mocking, based on actual physical condition, but not disability ("midžet" – midged, is used for small persons, "bajs" – meaning fat, for overweight or those who like to eat). Sometimes, the expression "invalid" (disabled) may be used as a mild, very general, insult, even though the person has no disability.

9. Hatred against socially-disadvantaged groups

Discrimination against socially-disadvantaged groups is sometimes referred to as "social racism" in **France** that can could be defined as differences and discrimination between social, cultural and economic capital of each social group.

Different groups are victims of this type of discrimination: homeless people — "clodos", "SDF" can be depicted as beggars asking for money in order to buy alcohol, as "fainéants" (lazy people) who refuse to have a job (40% of homeless people are working in France²³), as "crades" (dirty). With the so-called "refugees' crisis", there has been shift in the perception of homeless people: in nationalist, identitarian and far-right speech, a distinction has been made between French "real" homeless people and foreign homeless people (Roma, exiled people). The image of the French "real" homeless has turned in positive contrary to the foreign homeless arrived in France for taking advantage of the French welfare system.

Many stereotypes exist against people living in suburbs, depicted as "*racaille*" (scum), a term made popular by President Nicolas Sarkozy's statement: "*Vous en avez assez de cette bande de racaille? On va vous en débarasser*" ("Are you fed up with this gang of scum? We will get rid of that"). Another well-known insult is "*banlieusard*", social pejorative term used for distinguishing Parisians and people living out of Paris, in the suburbs.

²³ Yaouancq, F., and M. Duée. "Les sans-domicile et l'emploi. Des emplois aussi fragiles que leurs conditions de vie." *Insee première* 1494 (2014).

²² https://tg24.sky.it/cronaca/2018/10/22/beppe-grillo-autismo-sindrome-asperger-reazioni.html

People living in rural areas are depicted as "bouseux", "péqueneauds" (rednecks), while the word used for the cliché of the average French man considered as vulgar, not elegant, stupid and coming from lower social group is "beaufs" (douchebags).

Those considered socially disadvantaged in **Czech Republic** are single mothers, drug addicts, homeless people, poor people, persons with low levels of educational attainment and persons of low social class. Such persons tend to be ridiculed, humiliated or attacked online in various contexts with expressions like *pijavice* (leech); *přížvník* (mooch); *verbež* (vermin). Some of the offensive words used for poor people (such as "*socka*", which literally means a social benefit case), can be used to insult people in different contexts. The seemingly neutral term "social disadvantage" itself is used in official terminology, as is "social exclusion", but both terms can be deployed in sophisticated ways as euphemisms for Romani people, especially if a highly-educated speaker wishes to avoid referencing ethnicity. It is frequently claimed that the term "inadaptable", discussed above, is simply another term for social disadvantage, but it is much more pejorative in nature. Terms that are the equivalent of "low-life", "riffraff", "scum" or "trash" are frequently used.

In **Croatia**, words like "klošar" (bum) and "bijednik" (wretch) are wide spread terms used to describe poor people or homeless. Term "pička" or "pičkica" (pussy) is commonly used to define position of someone with less power in the society, e.g. for weakness, or man who is not ready to physically confront others. These terms are also examples of sexism. In the social disadvantage groups, commonly used term is "cigan", that is also an example of anti Roma hatred.

Discrimination and degradation of people not conforming to social values of efficiency and performance has a long tradition in **Germany**. Socially-disadvantaged people are often seen as "lazy" or as "parasites" ("*Parasit*"/"*Schmarotzer*") who don't want to work to change their living conditions and instead take advantage of social benefits. The term "*Hartzer*" was coined as a derogatory reference to long-time unemployed people as the German long-term unemployment benefit scheme is colloquially called "Hartz IV" after the manager Peter Hartz who conceived it. Homeless people in particular are indiscriminately perceived as "dirty" and alcoholics ("*Penner*").

Socially-disadvantaged persons are still excluded from public spaces, among mainstream society, in **Austria** – a phenomenon that is not new to the region. Persons, affected by extreme poverty, especially those living on the street or begging, are continuously perceived as "lazy" ("**faul**") and "workshy" ("**arbeitsscheu**"). Frequently words like "**Sozialschmarotzer**" ("parasites"), "**Zecken**" ("ticks"), "**Gesindel**" ("scum") are applied. Additionally, to being perceived as described above, persons are portrayed as not intelligent enough to be of use to society, which is why the word "**asocial**" is often associated with e.g. homeless people, meaning that persons are perceives as being incapable of integrating into society as well as incapable of adjusting to society's requirements, which are framed to be the "norm".

When it comes to online hate speech targeting socially-disadvantages persons, a great deal of research and analysis remains overdue. The phenomenon of online hatred against the homeless, those affected by extreme poverty or people, who beg (who can also be targeted by antigypsyist incidence, as begging persons are sometimes directly associated with the word "gypsy", connected to the portrayal of Roma/Romnja and Sinti/Sintize) is still too unknown in Austria in order to give a thorough overview and appropriate details.

Online hate speech against socially disadvantaged groups in **Italy** is not made of specifically derogatory words or expressions (only few could be identified, as for instance *barbone* (homeless), or *tos-sico/ubriacone* (junky, alchoholic). Hate speech against this category arises when, specifically in some Facebook groups, people share pictures or video of either poor or very poorly educated people fighting, searching for food in the trash, or people on drugs/alcohol in delirium or hallucinatory states.

Unfortunately, hate against these people is perpetrated through their systematic isolation from public spaces (in particular, touristic areas), through violence and beating, and also killings or their attempts, as it sometimes happens that homeless people are burned alive while sleeping.

In **Slovenia** there are not many insults that are linked to socially disadvantaged groups, only one quite wide-spread, "*klošar*" (beggar), mostly used for someone that asks for help or goods. We are estimating that other words in connection to socially disadvantaged groups are not used much for expressing hate.

Conclusion

This work shed some light on the social and cultural factors that are at the origin of the words and expressions currently in use to mock and harass people, and to spread hate against several minority groups in the sCAN partner countries. Despite some of the country-specific characteristics emerging in the present document, a significant number of similar traits and grounds of prejudice emerge, proving that cyber hate is a phenomenon that must be understood and fought against with joint transnational and EU-wide (as well as global) actions.

Among the main common traits or elements of cyber hate identified, some are of particular relevance and should be further investigated, namely:

- There is a general fear of so called "racial mixing", loss of national identity, traditions and values. This is well reflected by nationalist slogans like "Germany to the Germans"/" Slovenia to the Slovenes"/ "Italy to the Italians", etc. which are common among different countries and underline the shared ideology according to which people are divided in class A and class B citizens, based on them being nationals of the given country or not.
- Among the communities of online haters, there seems to be widespread confusion and lack of
 understanding of the difference between migrants, refugees, and Muslim people, as these
 terms are often mistakenly used as if they were interchangeable concepts. This is a starting
 point from which meaningful alternative narratives should be built.
- Antisemitism, conspiracy theories and prejudices against the Jews are so widespread that anti-Semitic expressions are used unconsciously by people who actually do not share anti-Semitic beliefs
- Intolerance against the Muslim people is fuelled by the spreading of fake and distorted news
 according to which Europe is undergoing a process of colonisation and Islamization which is
 endangering its alleged solid Christian roots and the Western way of life.
- Homophobia is often linked and associated with paedophilia (especially in relation to gay men), and the volume of cyber hate against the LGBT community increases in conjunction with events with national coverage, as for instance the Gay Pride and the debates on new Laws improving or extending the rights of the LGBT people.
- Misogyny emerges not only as a stand-alone type of hate, but mostly when a woman with
 national visibility uses her role to advocate and express support to a given cause. These attacks
 are often targeting the physical aspect and alleged behaviour of the target, even when they
 are of no relevance for the given debate.
- Derogative words related to mental and physical disability are often used to mock and offend people who often do not bear disabilities - this practice is indeed harmful and fought against by several associations advocating for more inclusiveness towards people with disabilities.

These elements and considerations are a precious starting point from which new discussions should be opened on the social and psychological factors that trigger the emergence and capillary diffusion of cyber hate. Parallel to this, they should raise awareness among each and every one of us on the potential hateful and derogative meaning behind some words and expressions that have now entered the common vocabulary as socially accepted codes.

References

ANED. Country report on the European Semester – France, 2017 (2018).

Camera dei Deputati – Commissione Jo Cox sull'intolleranza, la xenofobia, il razzismo e i fenomeni di odio (2017).

CDEC. "Rapporto sull'antisemitismo in Italia nel 2016" (2017).

-COM(2016) 379 final

Défenseur des droits - Rapport annuel d'activité 2017 (2018).

Dokustelle – Islamfeindlichkeit & Antimuslimischer Rassismus: Antimuslimischer Rassismus Report 2017 (2018). Available at: https://www.dokustelle.at/

Goillot, Catherine, and Pierre Mormoche. *Enquête handicaps-incapacités-dépendance en institution en 1998: résultats détaillés.* Vol. 83. INSEE (2001).

Imke Schmincke. Frauenfeindlich, sexistisch, antifeministisch? Begriffe und Phänomene biszum aktuellen Antigenderismus. In: BpB (Hrsg.) Informationen zur politische Bildung (2018).

INACH "Kick them back into the sea". Report on hate speech against refugees (2016).

INACH report, "Kick them back into the sea" (2016).

INACH. Manifestations of Online Hate Speech, Reports on antisemitic, antiziganistic, homophobic and anti-Muslim hate speech (2017).

INACH. Project "Research – Report – Remove: Countering cyber hate phenomena" (2018).

Quarterly Report May-July 2016

Quarterly Report August-October 2016

Quarterly Report November-December 2016

Quarterly Report January-March 2017

Quarterly Report April-June 2017

Quarterly Report July-September 2017

jugendschutz.net. Lagebericht Islamismus 2017 (2018).

Latvian Centre for Human Rights. Portrayal of Roma in Latvian Media: Summary of Monitoring Results 2013–2014 (2015).

Latvijas Cilvēktiesību centrs. Antisemītisma izpausmes: vēsture un mūsdienas (2015).

Mut gegen Rechte Gewalt. Ableism. Available at: https://www.mut-gegen-rechte- gewalt.de/service/lexikon/a/ableism

obec v Praze, Židovská. "Výroční zpráva o projevech antisemitismu v České republice za rok 2015." (2016).

Peter Widmann. Vorurteile gegen sozial Schwache und Behinderte. In: BpB (Hrsg) (2006).

Romano Centro (2018): Antiziganismus Report. Falldokumentation 2015 – 2017. Available at: http://www.romano-centro.org/downloads/Antiziganismus_in_Oesterreich_2015-2017_web.pdf [17.11.2018]

SOS homophobie (Association). Rapport sur l'homophobie. SOS homophobie (2018).

Stokes, B. Faith in European project reviving. *Pew Research Center's Global Attitudes Project*, *2* (2015). Susanne Gerull "Unangenehm", "arbeitsscheu", "asozial". Zur Ausgrenzung von wohnungslosen Menschen (2018).

Yaouancq, F., and M. Duée. "Les sans-domicile et l'emploi. Des emplois aussi fragiles que leurs conditions de vie." *Insee première* 1494 (2014).

ZARA: Racism Report 2017. Individual case report about racist attacks and structures in Austria (2018). Available at: https://zara.or.at/_wp/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/ZaraReport2017_Englisch.pdf [19.11.2018]